

Bear Valley Elementary School Considerations

Presentation of Information Pertaining to the Reopening Decision
of Bear Valley Elementary School

February 14, 2017 Alpine County Unified School District Board meeting

Lauren Schimke, Bear Valley Parent and Community Member, Facilities Advisory Committee Member

Patrick Traynor, Ph.D., Superintendent

Jill Wegenstein, Bear Valley Community Member, Facilities Advisory Committee Member

Overview

- Parent Survey Results
- Potential Number of Students
- Threshold Considerations (Financial and Educational Quality)
- Courses of Action
- Benefits of Opening BVS

Parent Survey Information Gathered

- School Preference Next Year; other preferences for Bear Valley School
- Grade Level Next Year
- Early Learning Needs
- County of Residence
- Additional Information - Open

Parent Survey Results

- Five Responses; 3 Alpine; 2 Calaveras
- One parent projected up to 15 students; Alpine and Calaveras
- All in favor of reopening the school
 - Technology
 - Skiing
 - TK-5
- Bear Valley Education Foundation
- No Charter School

Potential Numbers of Students

Grade	Totals	From Alpine County	From Calaveras County
TK	2	2	
K	1	1	
1	0		
2	5	2	3
3	0		
4	0		
5	0		
Overall	8	5	3

Factors in Reopening

- Only as a TK-5 School; 6-12 bus to Calaveras
- Early Learning Center
- Preparation Costs Reopening
- Operational Costs
- Consider Modular
- Architects long term recommendations
- Bear Valley Community Funding (Foundation)

Threshold Considerations

- Number of Students
 - Financial Threshold: Costs per pupil compared to District Average
 - Educational Quality Threshold: At what number of students does educational quality become too low to justify keeping open

Financial Threshold

Instructional Staff	Course of Action Example	Ongoing Costs for Instructional Staff , Classified Staff, Services, Utilities, etc.	# Students Needed to equal District Average/Student of \$20,000
1 Teacher; 2 Aides	Reopen with ELC	\$266,335	13.3
2 Teachers; 2 Aides	Reopen with ELC	\$366,335	18.3
1 Teachers; 2 Aides	Modular Lease	\$212,339	10.6
2 Teachers; 2 Aides	Modular Lease	\$312,339	15.6

Educational Quality Threshold

- How small is too small?
- Historical Information: Board has supported low numbers in Past (Kirkwood and Bear Valley)
 - 2010 Superintendent Fontana Board Presentation
 - “As the historical enrollment data for KMES and BVES indicate, the **Board has remained committed** to continuing to operate these schools **even with** the enrollment dropped to as low as **five** students. This points to a commitment to the needs of students and their communities as critically more important than costs.”

Educational Quality Threshold

- Grand Jury Investigation 2011:
 - When is it appropriate to close
 - **Determine “whether** Bear Valley Elementary School has become **so small** that it becomes **appropriate to close** the school **and bus** the remaining children to Calaveras County.”
 - Found cost per student in Bear Valley identical to District
 - Superintendent said, “**as enrollment dropped more parents** decided that they wanted their children to attend a larger school and **withdrew** their children . . .”

Educational Quality Threshold

- Grand Jury Investigation 2011:
 - Superintendent: Education Quality More Important than Costs
 - With Decreasing Numbers, at Some Point Low Educational Quality would Dictate Closing
 - Superintendent stated “she is prepared to **recommend closing schools when** she feels they **no longer serve the student needs** and that the School Board is prepared to make those decisions.”
 - Closing Due to Diminished Educational Quality would Precede Closing Due to Costs
 - Superintendent reported “**Monetary considerations** in fact **played a very secondary role** because by the **time** a school became so small as to make operating it **prohibitively expensive** on a **per pupil** basis, **educational considerations** for the students **would suggest closing the school**”

Educational Quality Threshold

- Grand Jury Investigation 2011:
 - Bear Valley Closed: One Student Left; Not Sufficient for a Quality Education
 - Grand Jury began their investigation when school was open
 - “On May 10, 2011 Alpine County School Board approved Superintendent’s recommendations to close . . .”
 - Superintendent: “Keeping the school open for **one student** would have cost about **\$180,000** and would, in her opinion, not have been the most appropriate means of meeting that student’s educational needs.

Courses of Action

- Reopen BVS
- Reopen with Early Learning Center (ELC)
- Modular Purchase; plan for reopening
- Modular Purchase; don't reopen BVS site
- Modular Lease; don't reopen BVS for next or more years

Reopen with TK-5

One Time		Ongoing			
Mold Abatement	\$12,500	Full-time teacher with benefits	\$100,000	Electricity	\$8,972
Water system restart	\$1,200	Part-time aide	\$20,000	Heating oil	\$17,805
Exterior Wall Repair	\$5,000	Part-time aide	\$20,000	Carpet clean.	\$800
Equipment Testing	\$2,000	Food Services Outside Vender	\$9,000	Fire equip.	\$117
Test FA Equipment	\$1,000	Additional Transportation	\$18,000	Alarm insp.	\$542
Fire extinguishers	\$1,200	Water	\$8,338	Snow remov.	\$1,700
Roof Repair	\$12,700	Sewer	\$1,322	Custodian	\$48,659
		Pest control	\$600	Supplies	\$6,500
				Telephone	\$6,000
Total	\$35,600		\$268,355		

\$303,955

Reopen with TK-5 w/ ELC

One Time		Ongoing			
Mold Abatement	\$12,500	Full-time teacher with benefits	\$100,000	Electricity	\$8,972
Water system restart	\$1,200	Part-time aide	\$20,000	Heating oil	\$17,805
Exterior Wall Repair	\$5,000	Part-time aide	\$20,000	Carpet clean.	\$800
Equipment Testing	\$2,000	Food Services Outside Vender	\$9,000	Fire equip.	\$117
Test FA Equipment	\$1,000	*Early Learning Center Total +/-	(\$2,000)	Alarm insp.	\$542
Fire extinguishers	\$1,200	Additional Transportation	\$18,000	Snow remov.	\$1,700
Roof Repair	\$12,700	Water	\$8,338	Custodian	\$48,659
		Sewer	\$1,322	Supplies	\$6,500
		Pest control	\$600	Telephone	\$6,000
Total	\$35,600		\$266,355		

\$301,955

Modular Purchase; Prepare for BVS Reopening

One Time		Ongoing			
Mold Abatement	\$12,500	Full-time teacher with benefits	\$100,000	Electricity	\$2,243
Water system restart	\$1,200	Part-time aide	\$20,000	Heating oil	\$4,451
Exterior Wall Repair	\$5,000	Part-time aide	\$20,000	Carpet clean.	\$200
Equipment Testing	\$2,000	Food Services Outside Vender	\$9,000	Fire equip.	\$29
Test FA Equipment	\$1,000	Additional Transportation	\$2,084	Alarm insp.	\$136
Fire extinguishers	\$1,200	Water	\$331	Snow remov.	\$425
Roof Repair	\$12,700	Sewer	\$150	Custodian	\$12,165
Modular Building	\$300,000	Pest control	\$2,084	Supplies	\$1,625
				Telephone	\$1,500
Total	\$335,600		\$192,339		

\$527,939

Modular Purchase; Do Not Prepare for BVS Reopening

One Time		Ongoing			
Modular Building	\$300,000	Full-time teacher with benefits	\$100,000	Electricity	\$2,243
		Part-time aide	\$20,000	Heating oil	\$4,451
		Part-time aide	\$20,000	Carpet clean.	\$200
		Food Services Outside Vender	\$9,000	Fire equip.	\$29
		Additional Transportation	\$2,084	Alarm insp.	\$136
		Water	\$331	Snow remov.	\$425
		Sewer	\$150	Custodian	\$12,165
		Pest control	\$2,084	Supplies	\$1,625
				Telephone	\$1,500
Total	\$300,000		\$192,339		

\$492,339

Modular Lease; Postpone Reopening Decision

One Time		Ongoing			
Modular Building Prep. and Transport	\$80,000	Mod Build Annual Lease (5 Year)	\$20,000	Electricity	\$2,243
		Full-time teacher with benefits	\$100,000	Heating oil	\$4,451
		Part-time aide	\$20,000	Carpet clean.	\$200
		Part-time aide	\$20,000	Fire equip.	\$29
		Food Services Outside Vender	\$9,000	Alarm insp.	\$136
		Additional Transportation	\$2,084	Snow remov.	\$425
		Water	\$331	Custodian	\$12,165
		Sewer	\$150	Supplies	\$1,625
		Pest control	\$2,084	Telephone	\$1,500
Total	\$80,000		\$212,339		

\$292,339

Unknown Variables

- State Funding Sources
 - Prop 51 matching funds through school bond
- Early Learning Center
- Bear Valley Education Foundation
- Other Existing Buildings

Courses of Action Summary

Courses of Action	One Time	Total Annual	Total Cost First Year	Notes
Reopen with TK-5	\$35,600	\$268,335	\$303,955	Permanent; Reopen Repairs Only; Long Term Not Incl.
Reopen with TK-5 (ELC)	\$35,600	\$266,335	\$301,955	Permanent; Reopen Repairs Only; Long Term Not Incl.
Mod. Purch. TK-5; BVS site next year	\$335,600	\$192,339	\$527,939	Temporary; Gives time for immediate repairs; Long Term Not Incl.; Have a Bldg.
Mod. Purch. TK-5; Don't repair BVS	\$300,000	\$192,339	\$492,339	Permanent; BVS site to not reopen as school; Decide what to do with BVS Bldg.
Mod. Lease; Postpone repair and reopening decision	\$80,000	\$212,339	\$292,939	Temporary or Permanent; Flexibility in extending repair times for reopening for next or more years